

ובא לציון אשרי למנצה AND אשרי RECITING

Although we recite: **אשרי**, **למנצה** and **ובא לציון** as a unit after **תחנון**, each is recited for its own reason. Let us begin by asking: why do we recite **אשרי** before **ובא לציון**?

סדר רב עמרם גאון (הרפנס) סדר שני וחמישי – ולומר תהלה לדוד, או יענך ה' ביום צרה בקידושא דסידרא, כך השיב. כשאמרו תז"ל כל האומר תהלה לדוד, לא אמרו או שנים או שלשה פעמים, ומשמע אפילו פעם אחת. אלא חכמים האחרונים התקינו לישראל שבעיירות, לומר בפסוקי דזמרא, ובסדרא, ובמנחה, שמא יפשע בפעם או בשתים, תשתייר אחת בידם, ולא מפני שחייב לאומרה שלשה פעמים. וראיה לדבר דהא שבת אין בה סדרא בשחרית ואין בה תהלה לדוד אלא שני פעמים¹. ואף בקדושא דסדרא בשתי ישיבות תהלה לדוד אומרין, ובבית רבינו שבבבל, אין אומרים תהלה לדוד. אבל בשאר בתי כנסיות יש שאומר תהלה לדוד, ויש שאומר יענך ה' ביום צרה, וסמוכין לומר שבת תוכיה, שאין אומרין בה אלא שני פעמים.

This excerpt from **סדר רב עמרם גאון** reveals two significant facts; that there is no obligation to recite **אשרי** three times a day and that there were two customs prevalent at the time of **סדר רב עמרם גאון** concerning what to recite before **ובא לציון**; **אשרי** or the chapter of **ביום צרה**. **יענך ה' ביום צרה**. That **רב עמרם גאון** said that there is no obligation to recite **אשרי** three times a day seems to contradict the following **גמרא**:

תלמוד בבלי מסכת ברכות דף ד' ע"ב ב' – אמר רבי אלעזר אמר רבי אבינא: כל האומר (תהלים קמ"ה) תהלה לדוד בכל יום שלש פעמים – מובטח לו שהוא בן העולם הבא.

That excerpt represents the version of the **גמרא** as it presented in the Vilna Shas. If you pay careful attention, you will notice the following note on that **גמרא**:

רבי עקיבא איגר – מסכת ברכות דף ד' ע"ב ב' – שם בכל יום ג' פעמים. בהרא"ש ליתא ג' פעמים, וכן בטור וברוקח סימן ש"ך איתא כל האומר תהלה לדוד בכל יום מובטח לו².

In the section that precedes the excerpt above from **סדר רב עמרם גאון**, **רב עמרם גאון** is more specific about why **אשרי** was placed before **ובא לציון**:

רב עמרם גאון (הרפנס) סדר שני וחמישי – שאילו מן קמי רב נטרונאי גאון ז"ל, הנכנס לבית הכנסת ומצא צבור מתפללין ועדיין לא קרא פסוקי דזמרה, מהו שיעסוק עם הצבור בעסק שמצאם, כגון שמצאם בתחלת עסק פריסת שמע, ואחר שיסיים תפלתו יחזור ויזמר פסוקי

1. תפלת מוסף in שמונה עשרה before **אשרי**.

2. The handwritten manuscripts of every **גמרא** are available for viewing at the Jewish University Library at

www.jnul.huji.ac.il/eng, Online Treasury of Talmudic Manuscripts. The manuscript entitled: Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Central, II.1.7 contains the words: שלשה פעמים. The manuscript entitled: Paris, Biblioteque Nationale, Heb. 671 does not.

דזמרא, והשיב כך, כשתקנו חז"ל כך תקנו לומר פסוקי דזמרא ואחר כך להתפלל. דדרש ר' שמלאי לעולם יסדר אדם שבחו של הקב"ה ואחר כך יתפלל. ואם ראה צבור מתפללין, והם מתעכבין, כך שמענו בי מר רב משה גאון ז"ל ומרבתינו, שמברך מלך מהולל בתושבחות ואומר פרשה ראשונה ומדלג ואומר הללו א-ל בקדשו וחזתם, וממהר ומתפלל עם הצבור. אבל לומר פסוקי דזמרא אחר תפלה, יש גנאי בדבר לומר שבה אחר תפלה. ואם אין לו פנאי כל עיקר אפילו לעשות כל מה שפירשנו, אל יאמר לאחר התפלה, שכשתקנוה לא תקנום לאמרן לאחר תפלה אלא לפנייה.

explains that since it is inappropriate to recite פסוקי דזמרא after reciting רב עמרם גאון placed אשרי before ובא לציון to give those who came late to synagogue an opportunity to recite אשרי at least once a day. This raises a further question: Does not reciting אשרי before ובא לציון present the identical problem; that we are reciting part of פסוקי דזמרא after שמונה עשרה? The answer appears to be that by adding the two פסוקים of אשרי to תהלה לדוד, we create a preparatory prayer that is appropriate to recite before a section of תפלה (in this case, קדושא דסדרא) based on the following:

תלמוד בבלי מסכת ברכות דף לב' עמ' ב' – חסידים הראשונים היו שוהין שעה אחת. מנא הני מילי? אמר רבי יהושע בן לוי: אמר קרא (תהלים פ"ד) אשרי יושבי ביתך.

That is one reason why we begin תפלת מנחה and סליחות with the פסוקים of אשרי. It is further the reason that some ask why we do not begin תפלת מעריב with אשרי³.

On what basis did רב עמרם suggest that reciting יענך ה' ביום צרה is an acceptable alternative to reciting אשרי?

תלמוד ירושלמי מסכת ברכות פרק ד דף ז טור ד /ה"א- /ה"ג / מתני' רבן גמליאל אומר בכל יום אדם מתפלל שמונה עשרה ורבי יהושע אומר מעין שמונה עשרה רבי עקיבה אומר אם שגרה תפילתו בפיו מתפלל שמונה עשרה ואם לאו מעין שמונה עשרה. ולמה שמונה עשרה? רבי יהושע בן לוי אומר כנגד שמונה עשרה מזמורות שכתוב מראשו של תילים עד יענך ה' ביום צרה אם יאמר לך תשע עשרה הן אמור לו למה רגשו גוים לית הוא מינון⁴.

This גמרא is the basis for the following:

פירושי סידור התפילה לרוקה [עה] למנצח מזמור לדוד עמוד תכו- אמר רבי שמעון בר אבא, אתה מוצא י"ח מזמור מראש הספר עד זה המזמור, שאשרי ולמה רגשו גוים חד מזמור הוא, נגד י"ח ברכות שאדם מתפלל בכל יום, והן אומרינן תתענה צלותך. כך אמר דוד אחר י"ח מזמורים יענך ה' ביום צרה, על כן לאחר התפילה אנו אומרים יענך, לאחר התחינה.

3. ספר כלבו סימן יב-תהלה לדוד כל האומר ג' פעמים בכונה ביום מובטח לו שהוא בן העולם הבא, משום דאית ביה אלפא ביתא ומשביע לכל חי רצון, ג' פעמים בג' תפלות, ומשום דאית דאמרי ערבית רשות ופעמים שבשביל צורך היו מבטלין אותה, אבל לא בהנב, התקינו לאומרה פעמים שחרית, ולא רצו לתקנו בערבית דלמא אתי לשהויה,

4. This גמרא does not appear in the תלמוד בבלי. The recital of למנצח after שמונה עשרה apparently is a מנהג ארץ ישראל that was accepted in בבלי.

TRANSLATION OF SOURCES

ישי -On the question as to what to recite before Kedusha D'Sidra, Tehila L'Dovid (Ashrei) or the chapter of Tehillim that begins with the words: Ya'Ancha Hashem B'Yom Tzara, this is what he answered: When Chazal said anyone who recites: Tehila L'Dovid (Ashrei), Chazal did not specify that it be recited twice or three times a day. One can therefore conclude that once a day is enough. Our Sages of the last few generations established the practice that the Jews residing in cities should recite Ashrei in Pseukei D'Zimra, in Kedushah D'Sidra and in Tefilas Mincha out of concern that Tehila L'Dovid (Ashrei) be recited at least once a day. Chazal provided that Tehila L'Dovid (Ashrei) be recited three times a day so that in the event that a person failed to recite Ashrei in one or two of those prayers, the person would still have one more opportunity to recite Tehila L'Dovid (Ashrei) each day. But they did not establish that practice because there is an obligation to recite Tehila L'Dovid (Ashrei) each day three times. We can conclude that there is no obligation to recite Tehila L'Dovid (Ashrei) each day three times from studying our practice on Shabbos. We do not say Kedushah D'Sidra in Tefilas Schacharis on Shabbos and we recite Tehilla L'Dovid (Ashrei) only twice on Shabbos. Even though it is the practice in two Yeshivos to recite Tehilla L'Dovid (Ashrei) as part of Kedusha D'Sidra, it was not the practice to do so in the Yeshiva of my Rebbe in Babylonia. In the other Yeshivos, there are those that recite Tehilla L'Dovid (Ashrei) as part of Kedusha D'Sidra and some recite Ya'Ancha Hashem B'Yom Tzara. Those who recite Ya'Ancha Hashem B'Yom Tzara rely on the fact that on Shabbos Tehilla L'Dovid (Ashrei) is recited only two times.

ישי -Rabbi Elezar said in the name of Rabbi Avina: Whoever recites Tehilla L'Dovid (Ashrei) three times each day is assured that he will be among those who enter the Next World.

ישי -In this version, the text reads: three times each day. In the version of the text available to the Rosh, the words: three times do not appear. The same is true of the version of the text available to the Tur. In the Rokeach Siman 320, he writes: whoever recites Tehilla L'Dovid (Ashrei) each day is assured that he will be among those who enter the Next World.

ישי -A question was asked to Rav Natroni, z"l: someone who enters a synagogue and finds that the congregation is in the middle of the service and he has not yet recited Pseukei D'Zimra, in what manner should he conduct himself? Should he join the congregation in what they are reciting, for example, if they are reciting Kriyas Shema, join them in what they are reciting and after completing Shemona

Esrei then recite Pseukei D'Zimra? Rav Natroni answered as follows: when Chazal instituted the rules of prayer, they directed that Pseukei D'Zimra be recited first and then one should recite Shemona Esrei. This is based on what Rav Simlai derived that first a person should put forward his praise of G-d and then recite Shemona Esrei. If a person finds that the congregation is in the middle of the service but has proceeded slowly, Rav Mar Moshe Gaon said in the name of his teachers that he should recite Baruch Sh'Amar, recite Ashrei, skip the chapters of Tehillim that follow except for the last chapter of Tehillim. He recites Yishtabach and rushes to be able to recite the silent Shemona Esrei with the congregation. However, he should not recite Pseukei D'Zimra after saying Shemona Esrei. It is a dishonor to recite praise to G-d after reciting Shemona Esrei. If he comes so late to synagogue that he does not have time to say any part of Pseukei D'Zimra, he should still not recite it after completing Shemona Esrei because the practice of saying Pseukei D'Zimra was instituted only to be recited before Shemona Esrei and not after.

ב' תלמוד בבלי מסכת ברכות דף לב' עמ' ב' -The first Righteous People would wait one hour before beginning Tefila Schacharis. On what basis did they do so? Rabbi Yehoshua Ben Levi said it is based on the verse (Tehillim 84) Happy are those who sit in Your house.

ג' תלמוד ירושלמי מסכת ברכות פרק ד דף ז טור ד /ה"א- /ה"ג' -Mishna: Rabbi Gamliel said: each day a person should recite all eighteen of the benedictions of Shemona Esrei. Rabbi Yehoshua said: it is sufficient to recite an abbreviate version of Shemona Esrei. Rabbi Akiva held that if he knows the words to all eighteen Brachos of Shemona Esrei, he should recite all eighteen and if not, he should recite the abbreviated version. Why eighteen Brachos? Rabbi Yehoshua Ben Levi said: it corresponds to the 18 chapters of Tehillim that open Sefer Tehillim and come before the chapter that contains the words: Ya'Ancha Hashem B'Yom Tzara (May G-d answer you on your day of woe). If someone challenges that count and says that nineteen chapters of Tehillim come before those words, tell him that the chapter beginning Lama Ragshu Goyim is not counted separately.

ד' פירושי סידור התפילה לרוקה [עה] למנצח מזמור לדוד עמוד תכו -Rabbi Shimon son of Abba said: you find 18 chapters of Tehlilim from the beginning of Sefer Tehillim until the chapter that begins Lamnatzeach Mizmor L'Dovid because the chapter beginning with the words: Lamah Ragshu Goyim is part of the chapter that begins with the words: Ashrei. The chapters of Tehilin were set up this way to correspond to the 18 Brachos of Shemona Esrei. After we recite them, we say: Answer the prayers to You, G-d. Dovid Ha'Melech was conveying the message that after reciting 18 Brachos, G-d will answer you in a time of trouble. As a result after reciting Shemona Esrei, we say Ya'Ancha, after reciting supplications.

SUPPLEMENT

A KINOS PROGRAM FOR TISHA B'AV

Because Tisha B'Av falls out on a Sunday this year, those coming to shul should have more time to spend reciting Kinot. This presents an opportunity to participate in a very simple Kinot program that may be prove to be very meaningful. Instead of rushing through the Kinot and reciting all of them, a shul can select about 20 of the Kinot to be recited in the following manner. Assign two people to each Kinah to read the Kinot aloud line by line. The first will read each line in Hebrew. The second one will read the English translation for that line. Two editions of the Kinot with English translations are available; the Rosenfeld and the Artscroll. All that is needed to run this program is one copy of either book. If possible someone should present a short introduction to each Kinah⁵. If there is a demand for it, a room can be set aside for women to present a similar program for themselves. I recently posted this suggestion on a Jewish Adult Education Listserv, Dibburim, and received some worthwhile feedback. As you can read from the responses, this type of program is being presented at locations around the world and has met with success.

Hello! Regarding your post about Tish'ah B'av, my experience at Camp Stone in Sugar Grove, Pa., suggests that this format can work very well. I've only been there these past two summers, but I'd encourage you to e-mail Yehuda and Adina Rothner to see how long the camp has been using/developing this format, and how its succeeded so far.

This has been done for a few years already here in Manchester England - very successfully. The crowds attending grow larger each year. It is run by Rabbi Pinny Brandeis head of the OurKids movement here in Manchester. Both men and ladies come and the service ends at chatzos. Certainly injects a lot of meaning into the kinnot reading and enriches the spiritual experience of the day.

I live in a chareidi community where it doesn't matter on which day of the week Tisha B'Av falls, it is always taken just as seriously and at the same pace. The shul is packed on both sides of the michitza for Eicha, but in the morning, women do not usually attend. There are women who would like to do something in addition to fasting and many daven and read some kinot on their own, but some have wanted to do something together, so, for the

5. If the Ribbono Shel Olam provides me the time and the strength, I will try to prepare a short introduction for some selected Kinot.

past several years we have gotten together in the late morning to read Eicha out loud in English along with some selected kinos, in English. We go around the room, each taking a turn for a perek or a paragraph. Usually someone facilitates it and leads a bit of discussion too. It is amazing how many readers break down in tears as they say the words and that helps everyone else cry too. The younger mothers don't usually attend so the room is filled with women from about 40-80 years of age. By that life stage everyone has suffered significantly and most of us have shared in others suffering as well. We cry for what we read as we think about women who were desperate enough to eat their own children, and for what we are going through, and for what we know lies ahead. And we are thankful to be in a community where we can cry together.

Perhaps if we make an attempt to understand and appreciate the Kinos, the רבוננו של עולם will hasten the coming of the גאולה במהרה בימינו.

אמן. כן יהי רצון.