

## יום כיפור ON חזרת הש"ץ DURING קדושה רבה RECITING

On **שבת** and on the **יום טובים** Ashkenazim follow the practice of reciting different versions of **קדושה** for **תפלת שחרית** and **תפלת מוסף**, but on **יום כיפור**, Ashkenazim recite the same version of **קדושה** for each of the **תפילות** of that day. The version they recite is the one that is said as part of **תפלת מוסף** on **שבת** and **יום טוב**. It is also known as **קדושה רבה**. Why do Ashkenazim change their practice for **יום כיפור**?

Professor Daniel Goldschmidt, in the introduction to his **מהזור ליום כיפור**<sup>1</sup>, provides the following discussion about this Ashkenazic practice:

It is our custom that the Kedushah that is recited for all the prayers of Yom Kippur are uniform and follow the form known as “Kedushah Rabbah.” In other words, the form of Kedushah to which is added the section that begins “Shema Yisroel” and ends with “Ani Hashem Elokeichem.” This practice is in opposition to the holding of the Geonim of Babylonia that Kedushah Rabbah should only be said for the Tefilos of Mussaf and Neilah, an extra prayer service on Yom Kippur. Truth be told, the Jews of France followed the Babylonian practice on Yom Kippur. Even in Ashkenaz, the Babylonian practice was followed by some as we find in handwritten manuscripts. As part of Tefilas Shacharis and Tefilas Mincha on Yom Kippur, they recited the form of Kedushah in which the words: Oz B’Kol and Mimkomcha are said. The first to record the current Ashkenazic practice was Rabbi Elazar, author of the book: Ha’Rokeach, who provided a mystical basis for the practice.

Notwithstanding that fact, a closer examination of Geonic responsa that concern the prayers of Yom Kippur reveals that the custom may have developed in some communities earlier as a result of the work of authors of Piyuttim who composed their Piyuttim following the Eretz Yisroel style. In those cases, the form of Kedushah on Yom Kippur was uniform and always consisted of Kedushah Rabbah. That form of Kedushah was accepted by Ashkenazim for use within all the Tefilos of Yom Kippur. Subsequently, our Halachic decision makers provided a Halachic basis for the practice.

Professor Goldschmidt in his comments is hinting that the change in practice among Ashkenazim may have represented an additional difference in practice between Troyes, France and Magentza in the Rhineland. The **מהזור ויטרי**, which was authored in France, does not provide for the practice:

**מהזור ויטרי סימן שנו-ושליח ציבור אומ' קדושה רבה למוסף: כבודו מלא עולם: ממקומו הוא יפן: פעמים. אחד הוא א-להינו: אדיר אדירנו: ימלוך: לדור ודור:**

1. I omitted the Hebrew version of the text to conserve space in the newsletter. The **מהזור** can be downloaded from [hebrewbooks.org](http://hebrewbooks.org).

Translation: *The prayer leader recites Kedushah Rabbah as part of repeating Mussaf Shemona Esrei on Yom Kippur.*

As Professor Goldschmidt notes, the רוקח presents the current Ashkenazic practice:

ספר הרוקח הלכות יום הכיפורים סימן רטז-ויגבה ה' צב-אות במשפט אבל כשישראל עושין תשובה ומתחננים ביום הכיפורים אז למטה קצת כה אמר רם ונשא את דכא ושפל רוח בעת רצון על כסא רחמים הנה ה' יוצא ממקומו<sup>2</sup> . . . לכך אמרי' ממקומו הוא יפן ברחמים ויחון על עם המיחדים שמו לכך אומרים ביום הכפורים בכל קדושות שמע ישראל ה' אלקינו ה' אחד וכן בנעילה בסוף התפלה אומר בקול רם שמע ישראל ואחר כך זכור ברית אברהם א' זה הקדוש ברוך הוא שהוא אחד ומהפך עצמו כביכול.

Translation: *(Yeshayahu 5,16) But the Lord of hosts shall be exalted in judgment, and G-d who is holy shall be sanctified in righteousness. However, when the Jewish People perform Teshuva and pray fervently on Yom Kippur, G-d moves closer to the Jewish People as the verse relates (Yeshayahu 57, 15): For thus says the High and Lofty One who inhabits eternity, whose name is Holy; I dwell on the high and holy place, yet with Him also who is of a contrite and humble spirit, to revive the spirit of the humble, and to revive the heart of the contrite ones. In a favorable time, G-d sits on His throne of compassion. G-d leaves his regular place . . . Therefore we say the form of Kedushah that contains the line that begins Mimkomo. That is further why we recite the form of Kedushah that includes the line of Shema Yisroel in all the versions of Kedushah recited on Yom Kippur. We also include at the end of Tefilas Ne'Eila the recital of the line of Shema Yisroel out loud and then Zechor Bris Avrohom (remember the covenant with Avrohom). Echad-the word One represents G-d because G-d is singular. By saying this verse, we encourage G-d to transform Himself from a G-d of justice to a G-d of compassion.*

Perhaps we can suggest a different reason why Ashkenazim began to recite קדושה רבה in all the תפילות of יום כיפור. That reason is based on the origin of the practice to include two פסוקים from קריאת שמע within קדושה רבה. Professor Ezra Fleischer in his book: *שירת הקודש העברית בימי הביניים*, Magnes Press, Second Edition, 2007, provides the following introduction to קדושה beginning on on page 32:

The Kedushah is a section of the communal prayer whose origin can be traced to early mystical sources and is described as originating as part of Merkavah (chariot) Literature. Two forms of Kedushah are relevant to our discussion; i.e. the Kedushah of Yotzer which is integrated into the first Bracha of Kriyas Shema during Tefilas Shacharis; namely the Bracha that ends Yotzer Ha'M'Oros (who creates the luminaries). The second form of Kedushah is found in the third Bracha of Shemona Esrei known as the Bracha of Kedushas Ha'Shem (the sanctification of G-d). In its two forms, the content of the Kedushah relates how groups of angels sing songs of praise to G-d as described by the prophets who witnessed examples of Merkavah activity. The two examples of Kedushah include the content of what the angels say

2. I omitted the mystical basis for the practice because I did not understand it.

when they sing songs of praise. They are the verses that begin Kadosh, Kadosh, etc. (Isaiah 6, 3) and Baruch Kvod, etc. (Yechezkeil 3, 12). Those verses represent the essence of what is known as Kedushah. While the Kedushah of Yotzer presents the Merkavah activity in story form as an extension of the retelling of the history of creation, the Kedushah that is part of Shemona Esrei requires the congregation to see itself participating jointly with the angels in the recital of the songs of praise. The congregation in saying this part of the prayer service, takes upon itself the responsibility of singing the songs that the angels sing in heaven. That view of what the congregation is doing when it recites Kedushah led to Kedushah being viewed as one of the holiest and most important prayers said by the congregation.

The nucleus of the Kedushah, the two verses from the prophets, are not said in isolation but are introduced with short prayers that serve as bridges between the two verses. Therefore in the Kedushah of Yotzer you find not only the two verses but also words that introduce and follow the verses. Kedushah of Shemona Esrei differs from the Kedushah of Yotzer in one important aspect. A third verse is recited in addition to the two verses; i.e. the verse: Yimloch Hashem L'Olam, etc. (Tehillim 146, 10). This verse is not an essential part of Kedushah and should not be viewed as linked to the other two verses. Instead, the additional verse should be viewed as serving as a means of transitioning to the end of the Bracha of Ha'Kail H'Kadosh that follows it.

As part of the Tefilos according to Minhag Eretz Yisroel, Kedushah included two additional verses; i.e. the first and last verses of Kriyas Shema; i.e. Shema Yisroel, etc. and Ani Hashem Elokeichem. Both these verses were positioned to be said after the essential verses of Kedushah and before the transitional verse of Yimloch Hashem. The Kedushah, as recited as part of Minhag Eretz Yisroel, consisted of five verses. Between each of the verses words of transition were also placed.

In ancient days, the two forms of Kedushah shared the characteristic of being said only as part of the communal prayers. A person praying alone did not recite Kedushah whether it was the Kedushah of Yotzer or the Kedushah of Shemona Esrei. The later Geonim of Babylonia began to permit individuals to recite Kedushah of Yotzer because the verses are included in what is essentially the telling of the story of how the angels conduct themselves. The Kedushah of Shemona Esrei until today remains a distinct characteristic of communal prayer.

The frequency in which Kedushah was recited differed between the communities of Eretz Yisroel and those of Babylonia. In Babylonia, they recited Kedushah of Yotzer each day whether it was the Sabbath or a weekday, while the Kedushah of Shemona Esrei would be said each time the prayer leader repeated Shemona Esrei. Under the influence of the Jewish community of Eretz Yisroel, the Jewish

community of Babylonia accepted the practice of reciting the version of Kedushah recited in Eretz Yisroel (the one comprising five verses) as part of the repetition of Shemona Esrei on Shabbos and on the holidays. The practice of reciting the shorter version of Kedushah in Babylonia continued for the other prayer services of the year.

In early Eretz Yisroel practice and later as an element of the main Eretz Yisroel practices, Kedushah was not recited as part of the Brachos of Kriyas Shema nor during the repetition of Shemona Esrei except on limited occasions. The Kedushah of Yotzer was said as part of Minhag Eretz Yisroel only on Shabbos and on holidays; not on Rosh Chodesh, Chol Ha'Moed, Chanukah or Purim and certainly not on fast days. The Kedushah of Shemona Esrei, as part of Minhag Eretz Yisroel, was said only during Tefilas Shacharis and only on Shabbos and holidays, Rosh Chodesh, Chol Ha'Moed and Chanukah. On other days and during the other prayer services, it was not said. The exception to this rule was the repetition of Mussaf Shemona Esrei on Rosh Hashonah and during Mussaf, Mincha and Nei'Lah of Yom Kippur when even as part of Minhag Eretz Yisroel, Kedushah was recited.

Professor Fleischer provides us with key information about קדושה רבה. It was the form of קדושה that was recited as part of מנהג ארץ ישראל whenever קדושה was said. We can therefore suggest that the Ashkenazim are reverting back to their roots; in other words, following מנהג ארץ ישראל, when they recite קדושה רבה as part of חזרת הש"ץ during the תפילות of יום כיפור. That answer begs the question: why did מנהג ארץ ישראל provide for the recital of קדושה רבה for each prayer service on יום כיפור day? The answer may lie in answering one additional question: Why did חז"ל institute the practice of reciting the פסוקים of שמע ישראל and לא-להים as part of קדושה? The answer that is provided in Rabbinic literature is that the practice was instituted because of a government decree that prohibited the recital of קריאת שמע in synagogue. I previously expressed some skepticism about that answer since the fulfillment of the מצוה of קריאת שמע does not require the presence of ten men. However, I may have overlooked one way in which the recital of קריאת שמע in the presence of ten men is very different from reciting קריאת שמע alone.

Thanks to Professor Fleischer's analysis of the material found in the Cairo Geniza, we can begin with the premise that reciting the two פסוקים of קריאת שמע as part of קדושה began because of a government decree that was issued against Jews in ארץ ישראל. That government would have been the one controlled by the Byzantine Christians. As will be shown below, the פסוק וקרא זה אל זה ואמר: קדוש, קדוש, קדוש, ה' צבא-ות, מלא כל: פסוק plays an important role in the Christian liturgy. The prayer that is centered on

the verse is known as the Trisagion. For Christians, the recital of the word קדוש three times by the angels in heaven confirms the existence of the Trinity. Below is a part of the prayer they recite. Notice how they interpret each reference to the word: קדוש:

Holy God  
Holy and Mighty  
Holy Immortal One  
Have mercy, have mercy on us.

I am no expert on Christian liturgy and do not understand all the terms included in the excerpt below from the book: *The Bible and the Liturgy*, By Jean Danielou, University of Notre Dame Press, 1956, but what is clear is that it shares elements with the Jewish practice of reciting קדושה except for the reference to the Trinity:

page 135-We must connect the Sursum corda with the chant of the Trisagion which follows it. Together they constitute the solemn introduction to the Canon. Both express the idea that the Eucharist is a participation in the heavenly liturgy. The Trisagion, in fact, is the hymn of the Seraphim who eternally surround the Trinity: "Man is as it were transported into heaven itself," writes St. John Chrysostom. "He stands near the throne of glory. He flies with the Seraphim. He sings the most holy hymn" ( XLVIII, 734 C). The same idea is found also in Cyril of Jerusalem: "We speak of the Seraphim that Isaias saw in the Holy Spirit surrounding the throne of God and saying: 'Holy, Holy, Holy is the Lord, the God of hosts.' This is why we recite this theology that is transmitted to us by Seraphim, so that we may take part in the hymn of praise with the hosts above the cosmos" ( XXXIII, 1114 B).

The Byzantine Christian government may have been concerned that in reciting קריאת שמע, particularly the opening line; i.e. שמע ישראל, ה' א-להינו, ה' אחד, Jews were denying the Christian interpretation of the פסוק: קדוש, קדוש, קדוש, ה' צבא-ות, מלא כל פסוק. It is not a coincidence that every time we recite the three forms of קדושה, we follow that recital with words that provide a denial of the Christian interpretation of the פסוק. Let us first look at קדושה דיוצר. After completing the ברכה in which we recite קדושה דיוצר, we begin the ברכה of אהבה רבה. According to the גמרא (ברכות דף י"א,) גמרא relates that in the event you fail to recite the ברכות התורה as part of ברכות השחר, you need not be concerned provided you recite אהבה רבה. Yet, the ברכה closes with the words וליחדך באהבה; to declare the unity of G-d, and not with the theme of לימוד תורה. With those words, we introduce קריאת שמע; the words that present a challenge to the Christian interpretation of the meaning of the words: קדוש, קדוש, קדוש. Perhaps that explains why we are directed to say the first פסוק of קריאת שמע aloud and why reciting קריאת שמע in

the presence of ten men is superior to reciting קריאת שמע alone. Which recital is more dramatic and more emotionally stirring? Affirming G-d's unity by the recital of the opening line of שמע ישראל aloud alone or in the presence of ten men, one hundred men or one thousand men? The Christians did not want Jews to publicly deny their interpretation of קדוש, קדוש, קדוש because they understood that in denying their interpretation publicly, Jews would be strengthening the resolve of those present and would be working towards ensuring that those present remained loyal to Judaism.

The inclusion of the פסוקים of שמע ישראל and להיות לכם לא-להים as part of the קדושה של העמידה can be explained in a similar fashion. In the opinion of חז"ל, the line of קדוש, קדוש, קדוש should not be recited without including words that present a denial of the Christian interpretation of those words. That denial is contained in the פסוקים of שמע ישראל and להיות לכם לא-להים.

A similar denial of the Christian interpretation of the פסוק is included in the recital of קדושה דסדרא:

וקרא זה אל זה ואמר, קדוש | קדוש קדוש ה עב-אות, מלא כל הארץ כבודו. ומקבלין דין מן דין, ואמרין, קדיש בשמי מרומא עלאה בית שכינתה, קדיש על ארעא עובד גבורתה, קדיש לעלם ולעלמי עלמיא, ה עבאות, מליא כל ארעא זיו יקרה.

The Koren Siddur translates the Aramaic Targum to the פסוק as follows:

*And they receive permission from one another, saying: Holy in the highest heavens, home of His presence; holy on earth, the work of His strength; holy for ever and all time is the Lord of hosts; the whole earth is full of His radiant glory.*

That the practice of including the פסוקים of שמע ישראל and להיות לכם לא-להים as part of the קדושה של העמידה originated as part of מנהג ארץ ישראל explains why in בבב, the inclusion of the פסוקים of שמע ישראל and להיות לכם לא-להים as part of the קדושה של העמידה was kept to a minimum. The Jews who lived under Persian and then under Muslim control did not feel the need to deny the Christian interpretation of the פסוק. It also explains the position of the רמב"ם, who lived only among Muslims, and those who follow נוסח תימן. In the opinion of the תמב"ם the פסוקים of שמע ישראל and להיות לכם לא-להים are never included within the words of the קדושה של העמידה (see Newsletter 7-19).

It is therefore understandable why Ashkenazim who faced challenges from the Christian community wanted to deny the Christian interpretation of the פסוק and to affirm the unity of G-d during all the תפילות of יום כיפור while on שבת and the other ימים טובים, Ashkenazim compromised by following מנהג ארץ תפלת שחרית and מנהג בבב during תפלת מוסף ישראל.